

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

True the Vote, Inc.,

Plaintiff-Appellant,

v.

No. 14-5316

IRS, *et al.*,

Defendants-Appellees.

**CERTIFICATE AS TO PARTIES, RULINGS, AND RELATED CASES BY
SUSAN MALONEY, RONALD BELL, JANINE L. ESTES, AND FAYE NG**

Pursuant to this Court’s December 19, 2014 Order (Doc. No. 1528285), defendants-appellees Susan Maloney, Ronald Bell, Janine L. Estes, and Faye Ng (collectively, the “Cincinnati Line-Level Employees”) provide the following information:

I. Parties and Amici

The following parties have appeared before the district court or are parties in this Court:

A. Plaintiff-Appellant

True the Vote, Inc.

B. Defendants-Appellees

Internal Revenue Service

United States of America

Steven T. Miller, in his official and individual capacity

Douglas H. Shulman, in his individual capacity

Lois Lerner, in her official and individual capacity

Susan Maloney, in her official and individual capacity

Ronald Bell, in his official and individual capacity

Janine L. Estes, in her official and individual capacity

Faye Ng, in her official and individual capacity

John A. Koskinen, in his official capacity

Daniel Werfel, in his official capacity

William W. Wilkins, in his official and individual capacity

Holly Paz, in her official and individual capacity

Cindy M. Thomas, in her official and individual capacity

Steven Grodnitzky, in his official and individual capacity

David Fish, in his official and individual capacity

Michael Seto, in his official and individual capacity

II. Rulings Under Review

The ruling under review is the final order and memorandum opinion entered in case 1:13-cv-00734-RBW by Judge Reggie B. Walton on October 23, 2014, granting defendants-appellees' motions to dismiss. *True the Vote, Inc. v. IRS*, __ F. Supp. 2d __, 2014 WL 5395036 (D.D.C. Oct. 23, 2014) (Dkt. Nos. 102, 103).

III. Related Cases

Linchpins of Liberty v. United States, a related case, was previously pending in the U.S. District Court for the District of Columbia. On December 12, 2014, Judge Reggie B. Walton entered final judgment in that case. *See Linchpins of Liberty v. United States*, No. 1:13-cv-00777-RBW (D.D.C. Dec. 12, 2014) (Dkt. No. 102). *Linchpins* is a related case because it involves substantially the same or similar issues raised in this appeal. On October 23, 2014, Judge Walton entered an order and memorandum opinion granting defendants' motions to dismiss in *Linchpins*. *See* No. 1:13-cv-00777-RBW (D.D.C. Oct. 23, 2014) (Dkt. Nos. 95, 96). Like the order on appeal in this case, Judge Walton's order in *Linchpins* dismissed a complaint alleging the discriminatory treatment of certain applicants for tax-exempt status because *Bivens* did not provide a damages cause of action in that context. *See id.*, Dkt. No. 96 at 8-11.

The *Linchpins* plaintiffs noticed their appeal of Judge Walton's decision on January 15, 2015, *see* No. 1:13-cv-00777-RBW (D.D.C. Jan. 15, 2015) (Dkt. No. 103). That appeal has not yet been docketed in the Court of Appeals.

January 20, 2015

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jeffrey A. Lamken

Jeffrey A. Lamken

Martin V. Totaro

Eric R. Nitz

MOLO LAMKEN LLP

The Watergate, Suite 660

600 New Hampshire Avenue, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20037

(202) 556-2000 (telephone)

(202) 556-2001 (fax)

jlamken@mololamken.com

Counsel for Ronald Bell, Susan

Maloney, Janine L. Estes, and Faye Ng

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on January 20, 2015, I caused the foregoing Certificate as to Parties, Rulings, and Related Cases to be filed with the Clerk of the Court for the D.C. Circuit using the CM/ECF system, which accomplished service on all parties.

/s/ Jeffrey A. Lamken
Jeffrey A. Lamken